INTERNATIONAL MEDIA FRAMING OF ISLAMOPHOBIA: ANALYSIS OF THE TERROR ATTACKS AGAINST MUSLIMS AND NON-MUSLIMS ACROSS THE WORLD

[1]**Dr. Ehtisham Ali Sethi,** Deputy Director, ORIC, University of Narowal, Narowal

ehtisham.ali@uon.edu.pk

[2]**Dr. Muhammad Haseeb Sarwar,** Registrar / Assistant Professor, Department of Mass Communication & Media, University of Narowal

haseeb.sarwar@uon.edu.pk

_____

"O mankind, verily We have created you from a single (Pair) of a male and a female, and have made you into nations and tribes, that you may know each other. Verily the most honored of you in the sight of Almighty Allah is the most righteous" **(The Holy Quran, 49:13).**

Abstract

The study is focused to analyze the framing of the islamophobia in the international media in context of the terror attacks on the Muslims and Non-Muslims where the newspapers from six countries including United States, India, United Kingdom, Canada, Australia and Pakistan are focused to study to analyze the major terror incidents from 2014 to 2019 in different countries of the world. The key focus was to analyze the frames including perpetrator of the terror incidents; Islam/Muslims are Progressive or Violent; Criticism on Muslims and Non-Muslims Perpetrators; Target are Muslims or Non-Muslims and Positive or Negative image of Islam/Muslims presented. The content analysis method is used to analyze the content about framing of the major terror incidents targeting both the Muslims and Non-Muslims. The study concludes that the selected international press presented Islam in context of anti-Muslim wave as they presented Islam and Muslims in a negative context mostly linking them with violence and non-Muslims are more target of terrorism than the Muslims. The study presents that the Muslims and Islam is targeted more despite the fact that they have also been target of the terrorism and extremism losing hundreds of lives. Only Pakistani newspaper presented a positive image of Islam and the Muslims convincing about the fact that Muslims are equal target of terrorism and extremism and Muslims also have suffered by terrorism.

Keywords: Islamophobia, Terrorism, Violence, Media, Framing, Muslims, Non-Muslims

Introduction

The term Islamophobia is a fear and prejudice against the Muslims and Islam. In the start of 1990s there were no concept of Islamophobia but Muslims were hated by the western people. Different negative content against Muslims and ideology were published in international media particularly in the western press. However, in the 21th century the proper negative agendas against the Muslims were started in western states. From last few years to till now Muslims are targeted by the western

people. Western media published negative ideology about Islam and Muslims in their reporting (Hassan & Omar, 2017).

The ideology of Islam and its practices shows as anti-Muslims and the Islam as Radical religion by the media of the west. All the Muslims of the world nowadays linked with this particular term. This term is particularly design and set by the westerners against the Muslims. After the Incident of 9/11 the condition of Muslim world is totally changed now. Today Muslim states are defending their Peaceful identity all around the world but due to first world media and their news coverage promoting the term Islamophobia which is against the Muslims and their ideology. In an inclusive book, (Baker et al., 2013a) examined the demonstration of Muslims and Islam in British press from 1998 to 2009, which shows that British press highlighted the concept Islamophobia and different pictures against the Muslim which contributes negative stereotypes. International newspaper portrayal Muslims and Islam as a threat and it cause stereotypical images about Muslim religion (Allen, 2012).

Through this term western media is promoting the different and negative perceptions about Muslims and their physical ideology. Islam is the second largest adherents in the world. According to (Hackett &McClendon, 2017) there are 1.8 billion Muslims in all around the world. Media promoting fear and tensions instead of peace and patience (Rupar, 2012). Today Islam and its religious practices are negatively framing in different western newspaper. Television channels, Mass Media and News agencies are trying to manipulate the facts behind all the suicide bombers attacks they coverage all the bomb blast news according to their agendas and mind set. The twenty-first century can be regarded as the age of Terrorism and a propaganda against the Muslims and Islam. The International print, electronic as well as social media use the metaphors and frames as Islamic terrorism, Muslim terrorist and radical Practices of Muslims these all term propagate and disseminate the fear of Islam amongst the rest of all other region and communities (Tariq & Hanan, 2018). Different internet forums serve to traditional media for the reinforcement of Islamophobia (Törnberg & Törnberg 2016). Islamophobia is not only a term it is a mindset and ideology which negate Islam as a hatred region and all the practices of Muslims are threat to non-Muslims. Western media propagate Muslim culture as driven strategy to promote Anti-Muslim ideology (Argyle, Gray, Nelimarkka &Terman, 2016). It is true that Terrorism is exit and it causing a dangerous consciousness all around the world but Muslims are also targeted by the terrorist. The Middle East countries Syria, Iraq, Afghanistan, Yemen and Pakistan faced many terrorist attacks, many Muslims have sacrificed their lives and their home because of terrorism. All the Muslims states are also facing the terrorist attacks and there is no Link with Muslims and Islam. Muslims had manifested through negative attitudes, discrimination, stereotypes, physical threats and online harassment (Awan, 2016).

The western propaganda and their Media outlets are disseminated the news of terrorism attacks linked with Islam and Muslims through their coverage manipulates the false facts against the Muslims. Media become more visible as in majority and it is in the hand of few people, their dominant ideology prevail among the public and they are sharing negativity around the world (Abbas, 2001). From last 11 years the term Islam-phobia is increasing day by day. It is true that

there is no place of negatively, hatred in Islam. There is just a myth about the Muslims that they are hatred to other communities and religions. Media also promoting different kinds of myths like Islamic Jihad is an actual terrorism activity, women who wearing hijab, headscarf are the facilitators of Terrorist and beard are the identity of Terrorist persons. These all things are the culture of Muslim Identity but it is not true that Muslim culture and terrorism, Extremism are interlinked. After Norway attack western media institutions used different words, tone and allegation against the Muslims and they were representing Muslims accountable for those attacks (Alghamdi, 2015).

Different states of the World many non-Muslims shows their aggression against the Muslims. The Muslims of the world hatred by the other communities. People of western societies now believing on the term Islamophobia they are aware the facts and figure behind the terrorist activities they just know that Muslims are Islamic ideology promoting the issues of the world. The perception of Islamophobia has taken central socio-political significance in the western states. It is commonly interpreted fear, hostility against Muslims and ideology of Islam (Umar, 2018). The Muslims who are resident in different western countries are facing the hate and negative responses from others. Today this term is injected in the minds of people by the Media. A study observed that journalism is under pressure from abating media economy, political biasness that drives news towards agendas (Perovic, 2016).

The study is focused to analyze the editorials of the newspapers (press) of the international stake holders including the United States, India, United Kingdom, Canada, Australia and Pakistan on major terror/extremism incidents in different parts of the world. Editorials are selected for analysis as they represent the policy of any news organization (Ali & Shahid, 2012). The editorials for two weeks of post terror incident are analyzed in the study.

Terror attacks targeting Muslims and Non-Muslims

The incidents where the Muslims were under target includes Army Public School attack in Pakistan in December 2014 claiming more than 140 lives amongst them 132 were children. Borno State bombings in 2015 claiming more than 100 lives; Attack on Bacha Khan University Charsadda Pakistan in January 2016 claiming almost 20 lives; attack on Quebec City Mosque in Canada in 2017 claimed lives of almost 6 worshippers in the Mosque; attacks on Mosques in Spain during 2017; Finsbury Mosque incident in London claiming life of a worshipper and injuring many people in 2017; attack on Christchurch Mosque in New Zealand claiming lives of more than 50 Muslims in 2019; attack on five mosques in Birmingham in 2019 creating an atmosphere of fear and panic among the Muslims living in the United Kingdom. Similarly, multiple other incidents of terrorism took place targeting the Muslims across the world during the selected time period. (Onishi, 2015; Roberts, 2017; Hashim, 2018; Malik, 2018; Aljazeera, March 16, 2019; Karasz, 2019 and Tariq &Hanan, 2018). The attacks on Non-Muslims includes the Charlie Hebdo shootings in Paris, France in 2015 claiming lives of 17 people including journalists and security personals (Petrikowski, 2015); Paris terror attacks in November 2015 as result of a series of terror attacks claimed more than 120 lives (Walt, 2015). In June 2016 Orlando shootings in a night club in Florida, United States claimed 49 people (Ellis et al., 2016). Brussels bombings in March 2016

claiming 32 lives and hundreds of injuries (Kenneth, 2017 and Ched, Boyle and Knoll,2016); Nice Truck attack in France in 2016 claiming more than 85 lives (Sanchez, 2016); Barcelona attack in 2017 claiming 16 lives (Stephen, 2017); Manchester arena bombings in 2017 claimed 22 lives (Morajea et al., 2017 and Tariq & Hanan, 2018).

Objectives

The objectives of the study are to analyze the framing of Islam and the Muslims by the international press and to analyze that whether the selected press has presented a discrimination oriented or criticism oriented (negative) framing of the Muslims and Islam. Moreover, to analyze that how the press of different countries has framed the Islam and Muslims related issues on the events of terrorism and extremism in different countries. The objective is also to analyze the press framing of terrorism incidents against the Muslims and Non-Muslims in different countries. The study is also aimed to analyze that either equal level of coverage is given to the Muslims and Non-Muslim targeted in terror incidents.

Hypotheses

H1: The negative image of Muslims/Islam is more than Non-Muslims by the selected International press except the Pakistani newspaper.

H2: The maximum coverage is given to the incidents where Non-Muslims are targeted.

H3: The International press framed more criticism on Muslim perpetrators rather Non-Muslim perpetrators.

H4: International press framed Islam/Muslims as violence promoters rather progressive.

Literature Review

Mass Media has the power to set the new opinions in the mind of the public. Today in the age of technology Media practitioners are also aware with the use of social media as an agenda setting and framing of false news. After the incident of 9/11 the western media have been significantly coverage the news about Muslims and Islam and the standards of news reporting is constantly declined. Different negative messages of Islam and Muslims are portrayal by the western Media (Ahmad, 2006). Moreover, the International media is trying to disseminate news against the Muslims and they interlinked terrorism activities with Islam and its practices. All the largest mainstream media of the world Framing and represented Muslims as a terrorist and make their association with different terrorist activities. Therefore, mostly western population shows dis-likeness towards the Muslims and their symbolic identity. The U.S new media disseminate that Muslims are specifically sexist and this perception shaping the public attitudes and also effect in Muslims policies (Terman, 2017).

Most of the Researchers have been studied that International Media becoming the cause of threat to Islam and Muslims identity in the world. International media focusing on some news stories and framing those stories against the Muslim and Islam. Western media are promoting terrorism, radicalism and associate these matters directly to the Muslims. Furthermore, most of the international news content base on negative news coverage which shows Muslims and Islam as a threat for western culture and their freedom of speech. According to Kabir (2006), In Australia Muslims believe that media negative portrayal of Islam has great impact on their economic and

social relations. The growing negatively of Islam and Muslims cause change in public opinion and academic studies of Muslims in united states (Alibeli&Yaghi, 2012).

The western authorized print, electronic and social media content are setting agendas and frame particular images against the Muslims and their symbolic identity. People of western states have certain mind set about the Muslims and they feel threat to make relation with any Muslim person. The international media coverage about the Muslims and Islam usually entail negative labeling, generalization of incidents, lack of facts and figure and reporting of one side image of any story. However, Islam is a peaceful religion and Muslims are not associated with any violent incident. Representation of Muslims on world media linked Muslims with extremism, violence militancy and radicalism (Kabir's, 2010). Different events like invasion in Iraq and the uncertain situation of Middle East negatively portrayal by the Western media. Furthermore, increasing of suicide bombing in the world have fueled the hostility towards Muslims communities globally. Newspapers articles and opinion pages are constructing the negative ideology against Muslims and Islam towards non-Muslims. The U.S newspapers has been collected the word 'Islam' in their news as an adjective like radical militant fundamentalist, political and Holy. American citizens feel suspicious for Islam and they thought Islam as awful religion (Firdhani, Indrayani & Soemantri, 2018). The Role of media is to reporting factual and fair news but media is reproducing the fear, prejudices, stereotypes and hatred (Hassan, Azmi & Abubakar, 2017).

The cultural values of Muslims and Middle East States demoralize by the western media. The real issues of Iraq, Egypt, Pakistan, Syria and Palestine are not representing in their actual way. Different International news agencies targeted the negative content of news against Muslim states they sell those content which promote their ideology and their agendas. The world Muslim and Islamic states facing negative societal representation. The power of Media negatively utilized by the western states to promote the phenomenon of extremism, terrorism, violence, immorality towards Muslims. The dominant representations of Muslims placed by the western media as a hybridized and symbolic kind of threats to the rest of the world. Newspapers of western states are trying to distorted the news for their readers and engage them against the false opinion of Muslims. As a result of false reporting the people of west are showing hate towards Muslims and their Physical ideology. In the world there are many states who Banned Hijab and Niqab for women. Media highlighted and associate Muslims symbolic identity like Hijab, Niqab and beard with the physical appearance of Terrorist. The term islamophobia has been mostly highlighted and promoted by the western states and the Media is using this term against the Muslim and their particular ideology. Westernize Media shows biasness by itself it also effects on the thinking of viewers in this field (Mannan & Al-Af, 2017).

The Mass media of western states are trying to manipulate the Islam as a hatred region and the ideology of Muslims are against the non-Muslims. The certain patterns of Western media connect Terrorism to Islam and creating Fear about Muslims which also cause climate of fear among non-Muslims (Powell, 2018). The different media houses of west are trying to penetrate their specific mind sets to rest of world. Today in the age of technology western world not only utilize the mainstream media but also use social networking sites for the strengthening of their

ideology against the Muslims. Likewise, first world states have proper knowledge to utilize social media as fifth war fear of the world. It is true that Islam, Muslims are peaceful religion and there is no link between Muslims and terrorist activities. Islamophobia is totally a user generated term by the western states against the Muslims of the world. Powell's 2011 study about post 9/11 states that media use frames to describe the terrorism act that is much different from actual act of terrorism done by Muslim than non-Muslims. This framing of media connect terrorism to Islam and achieving their goals by giving aids to the terrorist to create the climate of terror t. in this Research the researcher examines the 11 terrorist incident from 2011 to 2016 to see the coverage of media on these incidents to determine the changing of media attitudes if occur in increasing the awareness against islamophobia. The researcher sees the three themes to analyze the media strategies related to Islam. 1st one is depiction of the agent, second one is motive of the act, and third one is framing of victim.

The study described that media coverage the terrorism act from Muslims in a different way and the act done by non-Muslims in a different way. U.S media globally has effect and people follow the super power version that why it has great influence over public. It has seen that U.S coverage on islamophobia or Muslims has no changing in the selected time period. The study examines that U.S media coverage continue to frame the incident of terror as individual act that is only related to Islam and the Muslim are linked with the international terror groups. Moreover, he described that the Muslim citizen of U.S also included in this as U.S media target the religion despite from their citizen. U.S media feeding the fear of Islam and is reflecting the poor mentality of the west. The portrayal of Muslim in American press is totally negative. According to the researcher when an incident of terror happened, the coverage by the media is on that the terrorist is Muslim or not before the investigation of the terror act (Powell, 2011). The non-Muslim organizations that are fringe organization are in mainstream now to effect the media coverage these organizations effect the political global sphere and relation between America and Islamic Countries (Bilal, 2012). As researcher argues that if a terrorism act done by non-Muslim it is considering that he is mentally ill that why he did this kind of act but if the terrorism act done by Muslim person it is said that the people have links with international Islamic terror groups. The result show that the non-Muslim terrorist set free and have no more coverage on media but Muslim terrorist has long lasting coverage that is because the fear of Muslims threat continues on U.S.

Al-Manan & Al-Af (2017) examines that whenever we see the terrorism activity by a Muslim it is promoted as a "jihadist" activity in TV channels, Newspaper from all over the world. 'Jihadist' activity became the synonyms of terrorism. The western media frame the jihad activity in this context that Islam is encouraging their followers to kill the people who are not Muslim. The western media try its best to spread islamophobia in the world. The researcher tries to focus on that how western media promote Islam as terrorist religion and Muslim as violence orienteer. On the other hand, give hype to islamophobia in all over the world xenophobic attack against Muslims. The researcher tries to find the biases of the media against the Muslims and further have condemnation by the expertise of media. British writer Allen (2016) described in his book that British media play significant role in molding the thoughts of people in Britain regarding Muslims

and Islam by linkage of terror activities with Muslims. The result was totally unbelievable that this kind of coverage by the Media made the people of Brittan enemy of the Muslims. it is also seen that European Union Commission on Racial and xenophobic attack told that the British means of communication, the politicians of Britain and the speaks person spread islamophobia and speak against Muslims (Allen & Nielsen, 2002). The researcher told that white shooter promotes as mentally ill while Muslims represent as straight terrorist. The Fox News commentator of Britain Brian Kilemade said that all the Muslims are not terrorists but the entire terrorist is Muslims (Awn, 2016). Islamophobia is that kind of racism that is going to replace the Anti-Semitism. This kind of hateful materials against Islam promoted by media. Media links the terrorism activity with Islam and represents it as violated religion. This kind of propaganda is becoming the cause of killing of innocent Muslims by arguing the counter attack of terror. West has started war on terror which is actually against the Muslims and hit the innocent Muslims from all over the works. Media is performing the key role of increasing the violence against Islam by presenting them as terrorist on the screens.

Tariq & Hanan (2018) examined the international press for the representation of Terrorism and Racial Profiling –Islamophobia in their study. The study highlighted the history and origin of the word Islamophobia and different phenomena which is affecting the identity and stature of Muslims all around the world. The study purposively observed the theme, tone and structure of the print media in the prior terrorist activities and also examined the print media representation whether it was bias or not. Moreover, study also examined the role of international media in connecting terrorism and Islam with each other and how print media messages use for the promoting radical profiling of Muslims and growth of the term Islamophobia. The data was collected by the editorials of six leading International newspapers which were published from 2014 to 2017. Study sampling was created by the strata of 10 major international terrorist activities. In order to meet this task event methodology and content analysis were designed. Findings concluded this study that portrayal of Muslim and Islam in context of terrorism and its contribution inherently despicable mechanism of racial profiling of Muslims. Furthermore, the framing of Muslims, Islam and Terrorism activities in selected sample of editorials is shown as neutral.

Argyle, Gray, Nelimarkka & Terman (2016) investigated the Islamophobia and Culture Threats in American New Media. They conducted this study to examine the American public hostility towards Muslims and their linkages with terrorism activities. Moreover, many recent findings have revealed that media was creating the Muslims cultural threat which was promoting the anti-Muslims association with Americans. Researchers also observed the role of cultural threat in the promotion of anti-Muslim attitude by using two-pronged approach. Firstly, survey experiment was used which provide tentative result that framing of Muslims as a cultural 'other' efforts anti-Muslims attitude and this framing also negate Muslims as terrorist. Secondly researchers utilized the media analysis of large scale to explore the media framing in real-world analysis. Study findings pave the way for researcher to reach the conclusion that Muslims and Islam was portrayed as a cultural threat in American media which is associated with anti-Muslims views of Americans.

Theoretical Framework

The study is focused to analyze the framing of the international media (newspapers) focusing on the terror attacks on the Muslims and Non-Muslims in different parts of the world. The framing concept was introduced by (Goffman, 1974) presenting the frame analysis as the concept focuses on the individual's own thoughts and positions on the events and incidents happened during different time periods and the frames or the images fix in the minds of the people. This also termed as the understanding of the people on the events as they are projected by the media (Ali & Shahid, 2012; Yousaf & Ali, 2013 and Ali, 2014). According to Goffmann (1974) framing is based on the events presented by media which makes minds and understandings of the people related to different events and the incidents. Framing helps to establish a particular narrative creating different images (Entman, 2006). Media intends to set the opinions of the people on different events and incidents and the events are framed in such a manner that people understand the things as they are presented by the media and things are considered according to their framing by media (Ahmad, 2006). The international media framing regarding the Muslims is to frame them in context of their linkage with the terrorism (Terman, 2017). The negative framing of the Muslims by the international media has been becoming a continuous threat to the Muslims and Islam in terms of their position in the international arena (Kabir, 2006). While discussing the framing of the events and incidents of terrorism and extremism it is claimed that Muslims are framed differently than Non-Muslims by the media of the United States (Powell, 2018). The study in hand is bridged using the framing concept to analyze the framing of Islamophobia by the international media for the selected events and incidents of terrorism in different countries of the world.

Methodology

The content analysis method is employed for the study in hand as the method allows both the qualitative and quantitative analysis where the content of the media including the text and pictures are analyzed (Sarantakos, 1988; Ali &Shahid, 2012). It is a research method analyzing the content being objective using a systematic procedure observing the content both quantitatively and qualitatively (Berelson, 1952). The study is aimed to analyze the content related to Islamophobia and the media framing of the major terrorism and extremism incidents happened across the world from 2014 to 2019. The study analyzed the media content on the said topics in the international media (press) including the Wall Street Journal from the United States; Times of India from India; The Times from United Kingdom, Toronto Sun from Canada; Herald Sun from Australia whereas Daily Dawn from Pakistan. The editorials of the six newspapers from the selected countries from December 2014 to August 2019 are analyzed in the study focusing on the major terrorism and Extremism incidents happened in different countries of the world. The incidents are selected in such a manner that attacks and terrorism faced by both Muslims and Non-Muslims are selected to study that how the international media editorials treated the events targeted the Muslims and Non-Muslim communities. The editorials for the duration of two weeks post terror attacks are analyzed for the following terror incidents.

The incidents where the Muslims were under target includes the following incidents of terrorism;

- Attack on Army Public School Peshawar Pakistan
- Borno State Bombings, Nigeria
- Attack on Bacha Khan University, Charsadda Pakistan
- Quebec City Mosque attack, Canada
- Attacks on Mosques in Spain
- Finsbury Mosque incident, London
- Christchurch Mosque attack, New Zealand
- Attack on five mosques in Birmingham

The incidents where the Muslims were under target includes the following incidents of terrorism;

- Charlie Hebdo shootings in Paris, France
- Paris terror attacks, France
- Orlando shootings in a night club in Florida, United States
- Brussels bombings, Germany
- Nice Truck attack in France, France
- Manchester arena bombings, United Kingdom
- Barcelona attacks, Spain

The said terror attacks are analyzed in the context of following frames;

Frame-1

Perpetrator of the terror incidents

a. Muslims
b. Non-Muslims
c. Balanced/Mixed

Frame-2

Islam/Muslims are Progressive or Violent

a. Islam/Muslims as Progressive
b. Islam/Muslims as Violent
c. Mixed/Neutral

Frame-3

Criticism on Muslims and Non-Muslims Perpetrators

a. Criticism on Muslims Perpetrators
b. Criticism on Non-Muslims Perpetrators
c. Mixed/Neutral

Frame-4

Target are Muslims or Non-Muslims

a. Target are Muslims
b. Target are Non-Muslims
c. Mixed/Neutral

Frame-5

Positive or Negative image of Islam/Muslims presented

a. Negative image of Islam/Muslims
b. Positive image of Islam/Muslims
c. Mixed/Neutral

Findings
Number of Editorials Published on the selected incidents

Origin of Newspaper	Newspaper	Frequency	Percentage
United States	Wall Street Journal	20	14.9
India	Times of India	23	17.2
United Kingdom	The Times	31	23.1
Canada	Toronto Sun	18	13.4
Australia	Herald Sun	15	11.2
Pakistan	Daily Dawn	27	20.1
	Total	134	100.0

Table 1

Table 1 presents that Wall Street Journal has given 14.9% coverage; Times of India has given 17.2% coverage; Time Times has given 23.1% coverage; Toronto Sun has given 13.4% whereas Herald Sun has given 11.2% and Daily Dawn has given 20.1% coverage to the selected incidents of terrorism and extremism.

Perpetrator of the terror incidents

Frame	Frequency	Percentage
Muslims	77	57.5
Non-Muslims	45	33.6
Mixed/Not identified	12	9.0
Total	134	100.0

Table 2

Table 2 presents that the selected newspapers presented that Muslim perpetrators are more than Non-Muslim perpetrators for the terror incidents.

Islam/Muslims are Progressive or Peace loving or Violent

Frame	Frequency	Percentage
Islam/Muslims as Progressive	52	38.8
Islam/Muslims as Violent	69	51.5
Mixed/Neutral	13	9.7
Total	134	100.0

Table 3

Table 3 presents that the selected media has presented Islam/Muslims as more violent rather progressive.

Criticism on Muslims and Non-Muslims Perpetrators

Frame	Frequency	Percentage
Criticism on Muslims Perpetrators	78	58.2
Criticism on Non-Muslims Perpetrators	41	30.6
Neutral/Mixed	15	11.2
Total	134	100.0

Table 4

Table 4 presents that there is more criticism on the Muslims is given by the selected newspapers than criticism on the Non-Muslims.

Target are Muslims or Non-Muslims

Frame	Frequency	Percentage
Muslims are Target	44	32.8
Non-Muslims are Target	75	56.0
Mixed/Neutral	15	11.2
Total	134	100.0

Table 5

Table 5 shows that according to the selected newspapers Non-Muslims are target is having more frequency than Muslims are target.

Positive or Negative image of Islam/Muslims

Frame	Frequency	Percentage
Negative image of Islam/Muslims is presented	69	51.5
Positive image of Islam/Muslims is presented	49	36.6
Mixed/Neutral	16	11.9
Total	134	100.0

Table 6

Table 6 shows that according to the selected international newspapers has presented a negative image of Islam and the Muslims in higher percentage than positive image of Islam and the Muslims.

Perpetrator of the terror incidents

Origin of Newspaper	Name of Newspaper	Frame	Frequency	Percentage
United States	Wall Street Journal	Muslims	13	65.0
		Non-Muslims	6	30.0
		Mixed/Not identified	1	5.0

		Total	20	100.0
India	Times of India	Muslims	15	65.2
		Non-Muslims	4	17.4
		Mixed/Not identified	4	17.4
		Total	23	100.0
United Kingdom	The Times	Muslims	21	67.7
		Non-Muslims	8	25.8
		Mixed/Not identified	2	6.5
		Total	31	100.0
Canada	Toronto Sun	Muslims	11	61.1
		Non-Muslims	5	27.8
		Mixed/Not identified	2	11.1
		Total	18	100.0
Australia	Herald Sun	Muslims	11	73.3
		Non-Muslims	3	20.0
		Mixed/Not identified	1	6.7
		Total	15	100.0
Pakistan	Daily Dawn	Muslims	6	22.2
		Non-Muslims	19	70.4
		Mixed/Not identified	2	7.4
		Total	27	100.0

Table 7

Table 7 shows the country/newspaper wise coverage to the perpetrators terror incidents presenting that the newspapers including Wall Street Journal, Times of India, The Times, Toronto Sun and Herald Sun has covered that most of the perpetrators of terror incidents are the Muslims whereas Non-Muslim perpetrators are involved less in the terror incidents. Only Daily Dawn from Pakistan has presented Non-Muslims are perpetrators of more terror incidents than the Muslim perpetrators.

Islam/Muslims are Progressive or Violent

Origin of Newspaper	Name of Newspaper	Frame	Frequency	Percentage
United States	Wall Street Journal	Islam/Muslims as Progressive	5	25.0
		Islam/Muslims as Violent	14	70.0
		Mixed/Neutral	1	5.0
		Total	20	100.0
India	Times of India	Islam/Muslims as Progressive	4	17.4
		Islam/Muslims as Violent	16	69.6
		Mixed/Neutral	3	13.0

Origin of Newspaper	Name of Newspaper	Frame	Frequency	Percentage
		Total	23	100.0
United Kingdom	The Times	Islam/Muslims as Progressive	10	32.3
		Islam/Muslims as Violent	18	58.1
		Mixed/Neutral	3	9.7
		Total	31	100.0
Canada	Toronto Sun	Islam/Muslims as Progressive	4	22.2
		Islam/Muslims as Violent	10	55.6
		Mixed/Neutral	4	22.2
		Total	18	100.0
Australia	Herald Sun	Islam/Muslims as Progressive	2	13.3
		Islam/Muslims as Violent	11	73.3
		Mixed/Neutral	2	13.3
		Total	15	100.0
Pakistan	Daily Dawn	Islam/Muslims as Progressive	27	100.0
		Total	27	100.0

Table 8

Table 8 shows the country/newspaper wise coverage to the frame presenting Islam/Muslims as Progressive or Violent. The newspapers including Wall Street Journal, Times of India, The Times, Toronto Sun and Herald Sun has presented Islam/Muslims as violent mostly rather progressive. Only Daily Dawn from Pakistan has presented that Islam/Muslims are progressive.

Criticism on Muslims and Non-Muslims Perpetrators

Origin of Newspaper	Name of Newspaper	Frame	Frequency	Percentage
United States	Wall Street Journal	Criticism on Muslims Perpetrators	13	65.0
		Criticism on Non-Muslims Perpetrators	6	30.0
		Neutral/Mixed	1	5.0
		Total	20	100.0
India	Times of India	Criticism on Muslims Perpetrators	17	73.9
		Criticism on Non-Muslims Perpetrators	3	13.0
		Neutral/Mixed	3	13.0
		Total	23	100.0
United Kingdom	The Times	Criticism on Muslims Perpetrators	17	54.8

			Frequency	Percentage
		Criticism on Non-Muslims Perpetrators	9	29.0
		Neutral/Mixed	5	16.1
		Total	31	100.0
Canada	Toronto Sun	Criticism on Muslims Perpetrators	11	61.1
		Criticism on Non-Muslims Perpetrators	5	27.8
		Neutral/Mixed	2	11.1
		Total	18	100.0
Australia	Herald Sun	Criticism on Muslims Perpetrators	9	60.0
		Criticism on Non-Muslims Perpetrators	5	33.3
		Neutral/Mixed	1	6.7
		Total	15	100.0
Pakistan	Daily Dawn	Criticism on Muslims Perpetrators	11	40.7
		Criticism on Non-Muslims Perpetrators	13	48.1
		Neutral/Mixed	3	11.1
		Total	27	100.0

Table 9

Table 9 shows the criticism on the Muslims and Non-Muslim perpetrators that all the selected newspapers from United States, India, United Kingdom, Canada and Australia has discussed more on the Muslims perpetrators rather Non-Muslim perpetrators. Only Pakistani newspaper presented almost same level of criticism with a slight difference on both Muslims and Non-Muslims perpetrators.

Target are Muslims or Non-Muslims

Origin of Newspaper	Name of Newspaper	Frame	Frequency	Percentage
United States	Wall Street Journal	Muslims are Target	6	30.0
		Non-Muslims are Target	13	65.0
		Mixed/Neutral	1	5.0
		Total	20	100.0
India	Times of India	Muslims are Target	2	8.7
		Non-Muslims are Target	20	87.0
		Mixed/Neutral	1	4.3
		Total	23	100.0
United Kingdom	The Times	Muslims are Target	9	29.0

Origin of Newspaper	Name of Newspaper	Frame	Frequency	Percentage
		Non-Muslims are Target	17	54.8
		Mixed/Neutral	5	16.1
		Total	31	100.0
Canada	Toronto Sun	Muslims are Target	4	22.2
		Non-Muslims are Target	12	66.7
		Mixed/Neutral	2	11.1
		Total	18	100.0
Australia	Herald Sun	Muslims are Target	4	26.7
		Non-Muslims are Target	10	66.7
		Mixed/Neutral	1	6.7
		Total	15	100.0
Pakistan	Daily Dawn	Muslims are Target	15	55.6
		Non-Muslims are Target	8	29.6
		Mixed/Neutral	4	14.8
		Total	27	100.0

Table 10

Table 10 shows that the selected newspapers discussed the target of the terror attacks where the newspapers from United States, India, United Kingdom, Canada and Australia presented that Non-Muslims are more target than the Muslims whereas the Pakistani newspaper presented that the Muslims are more targeted than Non-Muslims in the selected terror incidents.

Positive or Negative image of Islam/Muslims presented

Origin of Newspaper	Name of Newspaper	Frame	Frequency	Percentage
United States	Wall Street Journal	Negative image of Islam/Muslims is presented	13	65.0
		Positive image of Islam/Muslims is presented	5	25.0
		Mixed/Neutral	2	10.0
		Total	20	100.0
India	Times of India	Negative image of Islam/Muslims is presented	13	56.5
		Positive image of Islam/Muslims is presented	7	30.4
		Mixed/Neutral	3	13.0
		Total	23	100.0
United Kingdom	The Times	Negative image of Islam/Muslims is presented	20	64.5

		Positive image of Islam/Muslims is presented	5	16.1
		Mixed/Neutral	6	19.4
		Total	31	100.0
Canada	Toronto Sun	Negative image of Islam/Muslims is presented	13	72.2
		Positive image of Islam/Muslims is presented	2	11.1
		Mixed/Neutral	3	16.7
		Total	18	100.0
Australia	Herald Sun	Negative image of Islam/Muslims is presented	10	66.7
		Positive image of Islam/Muslims is presented	3	20.0
		Mixed/Neutral	2	13.3
		Total	15	100.0
Pakistan	Daily Dawn	Positive image of Islam/Muslims is presented	27	100.0

Table 11

Table 11 shows that the newspapers of the United States, India, United Kingdom, Canada and Australia presented mostly negative image of the Muslims and Islam rather positive image of the Muslims and Islam whereas entire coverage of Pakistani newspaper was presenting the positive image of Islam and the Muslims.

Test Statistics

Newspaper		Perpetrator	Islam/Muslims are Progressive or Violent	Criticism on Muslims and Non-Muslims Perpetrators	Target are Muslims or Non-Muslims	Positive or Negative image of Islam/Muslims presented
Wall Street Journal	Chi-Square	10.900[a]	13.300[a]	10.900[a]	10.900[a]	9.700[a]
	df	2	2	2	2	2
	Asymp. Sig.	.004	.001	.004	.004	.008
Times of India	Chi-Square	10.522[b]	13.652[b]	17.043[b]	29.826[b]	6.609[b]
	df	2	2	2	2	2
	Asymp. Sig.	.005	.001	.000	.000	.037
TheTimes	Chi-Square	18.258[c]	10.903[c]	7.226[c]	7.226[c]	13.613[c]
	df	2	2	2	2	2
	Asymp. Sig.	.000	.004	.027	.027	.001
Toronto Sun	Chi-Square	7.000[d]	4.000[d]	7.000[d]	9.333[d]	12.333[d]
	df	2	2	2	2	2
	Asymp. Sig.	.030	.135	.030	.009	.002
Herald Sun	Chi-Square	11.200[e]	10.800[e]	6.400[e]	8.400[e]	7.600[e]
	df	2	2	2	2	2
	Asymp. Sig.	.004	.005	.041	.015	.022
Daily Dawn	Chi-Square	17.556[f]		6.222[f]	16.889[f]	
	df	2		2	2	
	Asymp. Sig.	.000		.045	.000	

Table 11

Table 11 presents the statistical analysis of the selected Frames in each newspaper where the results show significance of all the selected categories as $p \leq 0.05$ except F2 of the Toronto Sun i.e. $p \geq 0.05$.

Discussion

The study entitled "Framing Islamophobia in International Media: An Analysis of Terror Attacks against Muslims and Non-Muslims" is an attempt to analyze that how the international media has framed the terror incidents in different countries which resulted the killings of hundreds of human lives including Muslims and Non-Muslims. The editorial framing of the six newspapers from six countries is analyzed where the Wall Street Journal from the United States; Times of India from India; The Times from United Kingdom, Toronto Sun from Canada; Herald Sun from Australia whereas Daily Dawn from Pakistan. The editorials of the six newspapers from the selected countries from December 2014 to August 2019 are analyzed in the study focusing on the major terrorism and Extremism incidents happened in different countries of the world. The incidents are selected in such a manner that attacks and terrorism faced by both Muslims and Non-Muslims are selected to study that how the international media editorials treated the events targeted the Muslims and Non-Muslim communities. The editorials for the duration of two weeks post terror attacks are

analyzed for the following terror incidents. The incidents where the Muslims were under target includes the attack on Army Public School, Peshawar Pakistan; Borno State Bombings, Nigeria; Attack on Bacha Khan University, Charsadda Pakistan; Quebec City Mosque attack, Canada; Attacks on Mosques in Spain; Fins bury Mosque incident, London; Christchurch Mosque attack, New Zealand and attack on five mosques in Birmingham were analyzed whereas the incidents where the Muslims were under target includes Charlie Hebdo shootings in Paris, France; Paris terror attacks, France; Orlando shootings in a night club in Florida, United States; Brussels bombings, Germany; Nice Truck attack in France, France; Manchester arena bombings, United Kingdom and Barcelona attacks, Spain. These incidents are framed as the Perpetrator of the terror incidents; Islam/Muslims are Progressive or Violent; Criticism on Muslims and Non-Muslims Perpetrators; Target are Muslims or Non-Muslims and the Positive or Negative image of Islam/Muslims presented. The study presents that the selected international newspapers presented That the Perpetrator of the terror incidents are mostly the Muslims rather Non-Muslims except the Pakistani newspaper which presented opposite stance; The selected newspapers except Daily Dawn presented that Islam/Muslims are Violent whereas Dawn presented Islam/Muslims as more progressive; The selected newspapers presented more criticism on Muslims rather Non-Muslims Perpetrators but daily Dawn showed an opposite stance here contradicting rest of the selected newspapers; The international newspapers mostly presented that Non-Muslims are target whereas Pakistani newspaper presented an opposite stance here too and the international newspapers mostly presented Negative image of Islam and the Muslims whereas daily Dawn presented and entirely positive image of Islam and the Muslims. As far as the hypotheses are concerned **H1** addresses that the negative image of Muslims/Islam is more than Non-Muslims by the selected International press except the Pakistani newspaper which is approved; **H2** addresses that the maximum coverage is given to the incidents where Non-Muslims are targeted is approved; **H3** addresses the International press framed more criticism on Muslim perpetrators rather Non-Muslim perpetrators which is approves whereas **H4** represents that International press framed Islam/Muslims as violence promoters rather progressive which is also approved. The study presents that the Muslims and Islam is targeted more despite the fact that they have also been target of the terrorism and extremism losing hundreds of lives. The study observed massive level of killings in APS school attack, Borno Bombings Nigeria; Bacha Khan University attack in Pakistan; Killings of the Muslims as result of attacks on Mosques in United Kingdom, Canada, Spain and Norway as Weill (2019) says that the in the year more than 500 attacks on the Muslims were witnessed in the United States referring towards the attacks on the mosques in California and Queens.

References

Ahmad, F. (2006). British Muslim perceptions and opinions on news coverage of September 11. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 32*(6), 961 982. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13691830600761479.

Allen, F. (2012). *Islamophobia in the UK: The role of British newspapers in shaping attitudes towards Islam and Muslims*. Unpublished thesis, Birmingham College, UK.

Alibeli, M., &Yaghi, A. (2012). Theories of prejudice and attitudes toward Muslims in the United States. International Journal of Humanities and Social Science, 2(1), 21–29.

Alghamdi, E, A. (2015). The Representation of Islam in Western Media: The Coverage of Norway Terrorist Attacks. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics & English Literature, 4* (3), 198-204.

Aljazeera (2019, March 16) A summary of attacks on Muslims in Western countries, *Aljazeera.*

Argyle, L., Gray, I., Nelimarkka , M ., &Terman , R. (2016). Cultural Threats and Islamophobia in American News Media. *NCAPSA American Politics Workshop*, 1-44.

Awan, I. (2016). Islamophobia on Social Media: A Qualitative Analysis of the Facebook's Walls of Hate. *International Journal of Cyber Criminology, 10*(1), 1-20. DOI: 10.5281/zenodo.58517

Baker, Paul, Gabrielatos, Costas, Mc Enery, Tony. (2013a). Discourse Analysis and Media Attitudes: *The Representation of Islam in the British Press*. Cambridge University Press: Baker, Paul, Gabrielatos.

C. Hackett, D. McClendon, Christians Remain World's Largest Religious Group, but They Are Declining in Europe. Pew Research Center. [Online], Retrieved October 10, 2019 from http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/04/05/christians-remain-   worlds-largest-religious-group-but-they-are-declining-in-europe/, 2017.

Dearden, L. (2019). Birmingham mosque attacks: Man charged with 'religiously-aggravated criminal damage' after Muslim places of worship targeted, *Independent.*

Dewan, A., Jordan, C., Halasz, S. and George, S. (2017, June 19). "London mosque attack suspect named, according to media outlets, *CNN.*

Firdhani, A, R., Indrayani, L, M., & Soemantri, Y , S. (2018). How Islam is represented in The United States Newspapers Published in COCA. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research, 254,* 1-6.

Hassan, I., Azmi , M, N ., & Abubakar , U , I .(2017). Framing Islam in News Reporting: A Comparative Content Analysis. *Asian social Science, 13*(10), 112-119. https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v13n10p112.

Hassan, F., & Omar, S, Z. (2017). Illustrating News Bias Towards Islam and Muslims in Malaysia and Indonesia by Wall Street Journal and The Telegraph. *Asia Pacific Media Educator, 27* (1), 1-16. DOI: 10.1177/1326365X17702275.

Hashim, A. (2018). In Pakistan, wounds of Peshawar school attack reopen each winter, *Aljazeera.*

Kabir, N. (2006). Representation of Islam and Muslims in the Australian Media, 2001–2005. Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs, 26(3), 37–41. http://doi. org/10.1080/13602000601141281.

Kabir, S. (2010). Representation of French Muslim minorities in a New Zealand newspaper. *The Jl of the South East Asia Res Centre for Comm& Hum, 2*(1), 33-46. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13602004.2012.727293.

Karasz, P. (2019, March 21). U.K. Police Investigating Attacks on 5 Mosques in Birmingham*, The New York Times.*

Malik, H. (2018, May 17). SC suspends death sentence of Bacha Khan University attack mastermind, The Express Tribune.

Mannan , M. F. A., & Al-Af .(2017). The Role of Western Mainstream   Media: How Islam is being branded as promoter of violence.   *People: International Journal of Social Sciences, 3*(3), 424-439. DOI https://dx.doi.org/10.20319/pijss.2017.33.424439

Perovic, B. (2016). Islamophobia and Media Representation of Refugees in Serbia. *Marmara İletişimDergisi / Marmara Journal of Communication*, (25), 17-34. DOI: 10.17829/midr.20162520715

Powell, K, A. (2018). Framing Islam/Creating Fear: An Analysis of U.S. Media Coverage of Terrorism from 2011–2016.*MDPI Journal Religious, 9,* 1-15.doi:10.3390/rel9090257

Robinson, M. (2019). Birmingham mosque attacks probed by counter-terrorism officers, *CNN.*

Rupar, V. (2012). *Getting the facts right: Reporting ethnicity and religion.* Brussels: European Commission.

Roberts, R. (2017). Pakistan: Three years after 140 died in the Peshawar school massacre, what has changed? *Independent.*

Scott, P. (2018, August 14). Finsbury Park attack, *The Telegraph.*

Törnberg, A., & Törnberg, P. (2016). Muslims in social media discourse: Combining   topic modeling and critical discourse analysis. *Discourse, Context and Media, 13*, 132- 142. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.dcm.2016.04.003.

Terman, R. (2017). Islamophobia and Media Portrayals of Muslim Women: A Computational Text Analysis of U.S. News Coverage. *International Studies Quarterly*, 1-45.

Tariq, K., &Hanan, M, A. (2018). Terrorism and Racial Profiling-Islamophobia in International Press. *Journal of Islamic Though and Civilization, 8*(2), 127- 144.

Umar, M. (2018). *Islamphobia in the Media*. Unpublished Bachelor thesis, Markfield Institute of higher Education, UK.

Weill, K. (2019). More Than 500 Attacks on Muslims in America This Year, *Daily Beast.*